

### Argument Analysis

Read these quotations and develop a claim **for the use** of the Rorschach and other projective tests.

- “The Rorschach's champions have often been almost worshipful in their belief in its ability to pare back the layers of the psyche, and the test is generally regarded as offering a richness of information about a person's psychological world that cannot be gained from interviews or from ‘self-report’ tests....”
- “With the comprehensive system, the test can yield a complex picture of people's psychological strengths and weaknesses, the Rorschach's proponents say, including their intelligence and overall mental functioning.”
- “The test is considered particularly powerful in situations in which people may not be expected to volunteer negative information about themselves.”
- “‘There are plenty of studies that show the Rorschach can help you identify people who have schizophrenia or whether people are depressed,’ Dr. Weiner said, ‘but the test doesn't make the diagnosis. No single test that a clinician uses makes the diagnosis. If you're going to use this instrument effectively, you're going to take a lot of things into consideration.’”
- “‘If you're interested only in some diagnostic labeling,’ Dr. Exner said, ‘I don't know that the Rorschach is worth doing, not simply because of time but because you're flooded with information that you're not going to use. On the other hand, if you're going to treat someone, I think the Rorschach is a pretty sturdy instrument.’”

The Rorschach and other projective tests can provide users with information about a person's psychological strengths and weaknesses, which cannot be learned through conversation alone.

Read these quotations and develop a claim **against the use** of the Rorschach and other projective tests.

- “The tests, which often take hours to score and interpret, add little information beyond what can be gleaned from far less time-consuming assessments, the psychologists say.”
- “‘There has been a substantial gap between the clinical use of these tests and what the research suggests about their validity.’”
- “Over the years, the test's detractors have also been zealous, making at times brutal attacks on its scientific validity, especially in the 1950's and 1960's, when practitioners varied greatly in the ways they administered and scored the tests.”
- “‘Another problem with the Rorschach, the psychologists say in their review, is that the test tends to ‘overpathologize,’ making even normal people look maladjusted.’”

The Rorschach and other projective tests are not very useful because take a lot of time to score, have questionable validity, and tend to ‘overpathologize’ people.

- Consider the controversy surrounding the use of projective tests.
- Locate instances in “What is an Inkblot? Some Say, Not Much” where the author shifts between opposing viewpoints.
- Describe how the author recognizes opposing or conflicting viewpoints. Pay close attention to the words the author uses and the structure of her sentences. Provide examples from the article in your description.

There are several shifts in the article. The author starts by explaining how popular the Rorschach test is and then she says how controversial the test is. She makes this shift with the phrase, “Yet almost since its creation.” The author also indicates that a new article has come out which says that projective tests are not useful. She introduces this idea by saying, “The debate is likely to become even more heated with the publication of an article provoking discussion and anger among clinicians who routinely use the Rorschach.”

Some other phrases the author uses to shift between opposing viewpoints are “while the Rorschach and the other techniques may be valuable in certain specific situations,” “over the years,” “but he added,” and “but even.” The author also elaborates on what she is saying by using phrases such as, “one of those is” and “another problem.” She often begins her sentences with these phrases followed by the viewpoint and evidence she wants to share.

What is a central idea of the article? Why did the author write this text? What is her purpose in writing?

A central idea of the article is that while projective tests have been used for many years and are quite popular with some doctors, some doctors question whether the use of projective tests is valid and whether the tests should continue to be used as they have been.

The author is writing this article in response to a new article that has come out against the use of projective tests. The author wants to describe the controversy surrounding the use of projective tests, which is likely to start up again with the publication of the new article. She provides information about the history of projective tests and the various strengths and weaknesses of the tests. The author does not take a side in the debate about projective tests.